

mentation of the Lieutenant-Governor in Council, and would be competent to inquire into the matter in a thoroughly impartial way. Having regard to a past experience in such matters where political feelings and emotions were involved, it would be desirable for all parties to remove the investigation from such influences.

"I think the judgment of such a tribunal, uninfluenced by political consideration, as it should be—and it certainly would not be influenced by political considerations as against hon. members named in the statement of my hon. friend—would carry more weight with the House and with the country than would any conclusion reached by the majority or the minority of a committee having political feelings, emotions and resentments."

#### The Charges in Detail.

The charges in detail follow.

"I, William Proudfoot, a member of the Legislature for the electoral district of Centre Huron, in the Province of Ontario, Dominion of Canada, declare that I am credibly informed and I believe that I can establish by satisfactory evidence:

"That Taylor, Scott & Company entered into a contract with the Hon. William J. Hanna, the Provincial Secretary of the Province of Ontario, for and on behalf of the said Province, on the 20th day of July, A.D. 1905, for the term of five years from the 1st day of September, 1905, to the 1st day of September, 1910, whereby said company was to manufacture washboards and other articles as therein set forth at the Central Prison belonging to the said Province. The said Province to maintain and provide the wood-working shop then installed in said prison, and to supply a minimum of eighty men, and if more required, up to a total of one-third of the total prisoners. The said Taylor, Scott & Company to pay therefor according to the schedule set forth in said agreement, and also in an agreement which was subsequently come to between the said parties.

"In the years 1907 and 1908, certain disputes arose between the said parties, in which the said Taylor, Scott & Company claimed that the Province was not fulfilling and had not fulfilled its said agreement, whereby they claimed to be entitled to damages.

"The said dispute, and others which rose from time to time, continued down to the 18th day of November, A.D. 1911, when same were referred to one L. E. C. Thorne for adjudication.

#### Sum of \$500 Paid.

"In the year 1908 the said Taylor, Scott & Co., or George C. Taylor, was requested to make a contribution to the party funds of the Provincial Conservative party of the said Province, then being in office, or to the Provincial Secretary aforesaid, and in accordance with such request did contribute and pay over to the said Provincial Secretary the sum of \$500; said payment being illegal, corrupt and subversive of good government.

"In the beginning of the year 1911 the said firm of Taylor, Scott & Co. made various efforts to procure a settlement of their claim without success. Finally they applied to the Honorable the Attorney-General for a fiat to enable them to commence legal proceedings. The claim then put forward was for the sum of \$19,463.02, made up of damages suffered through various alleged breaches of said agreement.

"The application for the said fiat was greatly delayed, and the said George C. Taylor decided that it could not be procured through the ordinary and proper channels. Thereupon, and on a number of occasions, he interviewed the said Hon. the Provincial Secretary, who took the ground that the said company had no valid or legal claim. The said George C. Taylor contended that they had a good claim, and insisted on said fiat being granted, and accused the said Provincial Secretary amongst other things as follows:—

#### Mr. Taylor's Accusation.

"That he, the said Hanna, had accepted the said sum of \$500 from the said Taylor, thereby leading the said Taylor to believe that his claim would be satisfied, and that the said sum was paid in consideration thereof, and that the same was given for alleged political and party purposes, as hereinbefore set forth; that the said Hanna manipulated the opening and granting of certain coal tenders; that there

were grave irregularities in connection with the purchase of certain self-feeding stokers, and that the said Hanna had otherwise acted in an improper, corrupt and illegal manner, and against the good government of the Province and the administration of the public affairs thereof.

"All of these matters were laid before the Hon. Sir James Pliny Whitney, Prime Minister of the Province of Ontario, and within a few days afterwards said fiat was granted, but on the understanding that it was not to be used for three months. The House was then in session.

"This was followed by the service of a petition of right by the said firm, wherein they claimed \$50,000 damages, although their said claim, as presented to the department, amounted only to the sum of \$19,463.02. A defence was put in by the Province disputing the whole of said claim, which was, according to the reports of the Government officials, wholly unfounded.

#### Attempt to Have Charges Withdrawn.

"Great delay in the prosecution or adjustment of said claim was caused by the said Provincial Secretary corruptly and improperly endeavoring to obtain in the meantime a letter or document from the said Taylor withdrawing all charges made by the said Taylor in the premises.

"In November, 1911, after the then approaching general elections were announced, the said George C. Taylor insisted on said claim being disposed of before the elections, again making use of the same arguments on which the said fiat was granted. On the strength whereof he succeeded, through the said Hon. Sir James Pliny Whitney and the Hon. the Provincial Secretary, in having the claim referred to the said L. E. C. Thorne, as sole referee, without appeal, his award to be made within 30 days from said date, and the amount found to be due paid within 60 days from said date.

"The said referee was appointed on Saturday, November 18th, 1911, at 4 p.m. He made an award on the 24th of said month, without taking evidence, whereby he found the said firm entitled to \$21,068.03. This sum was paid on January 17, 1912. The said referee was paid \$500 by the Province and \$750 by said firm for his services."

The division on Sir James Whitney's amendment to Mr. Proudfoot's motion substituting the Committee on Privileges and Elections for a Royal Commission was 64 to 15. The members voted as follows for the amendment:

Yeas—Anderson (Essex), Armstrong, Bennewies, Black, Brewster, Brower, Carscallen, Chambers, Cook, Crawford, Dargavel, Devitt, Donovan, Duff, Ebbs, Ellis, Ferguson (Grenville), Foy, Fraser, Galna, Godfrey, Gooderham, Grant, Grigg, Hanna, Hart, Hearst, Hendrie, Johnson, Lucas, McCowan, McCrea, McElroy, McGarry, McKeown, McNaught, McPherson, MacArthur, Macdiarmid, Machin, Mason, Mathieu, Milligan, Mills, Morel, Musgrove, Neely, Nixon, Norman, Owens, Pattinson, Pratt, Preston (Durham), Preston (Lanark), Pync, Reaume, Regan, Shillington, Studholme, Thompson (Peterborough), Torrance, Westbrook, Whitesides, Whitney—64.

Nays—Anderson (Bruce), Atkinson, Bowman, Elliot, Ferguson (Kent), Kohler, McDonald, McQueen, Marshall, Mayberr, Munro, Proudfoot, Richardson, Rowell, Sinclair—15.

Immediately after the vote was taken the House adjourned, and the Conservative members gathered around Sir James Whitney and Hon. Mr. Hanna and gave three hearty cheers.