

tinues?" the Liberal leader queried. The United States had followed such a policy with disastrous results. "I commend to the immediate consideration of the Minister in charge," submitted Hon. Mr. MacKay, "the necessity for tackling the problem of afforestation and reforestation in a practical and reasonable way." He counselled an amendment to the municipal act, under which municipalities in older Ontario should have the right to purchase land, and spend money under Government direction in foresting them.

Hon. Mr. MacKay, proceeding, said he was proud of his Liberalism every time he contemplated the growing revenues of the Province. The money was flowing in through the channels dugged out by the predecessors of the present Administration. He alluded to the corporation tax, succession duties, the tax on brewers and distillers, the figures of which he quoted, and the Dominion subsidy, for which the Government was not responsible. From 1904 to 1909 the revenue of the Province had increased by \$2,600,000. The sources he had indicated accounted for \$2,226,000. The increased revenue to-day, accordingly, was due to the constructive financing of the past.

"The finances of this Province," declared the Liberal leader, "are, and always were, in a sound, staple and safe position."

A Warning Unheeded.

Passing on to the educational situation, Hon. Mr. MacKay charged the present dearth of teachers to the abolition of the model schools. Two years ago he had given warning of this condition, but the Government turned a deaf ear to the warning. "I have no doubt," the speaker declared, "that ten per cent. of the rural public schools are to-day in the hands of unqualified teachers."

The trouble was characteristic of the Government. "Its great danger is the tendency to one-man power and centralization." Carried to the excess in which the Government practised it, it was a serious danger.

Why Not Publish Books?

As to the school books, the full bill of expense was not yet in evidence. The Government had prepared the material, set the type, purchased the plates, etc. "Having done all this," summed up the leader, "why not go the whole way and publish the books?" (Applause.) He condemned the awarding of the contract to a large departmental store, and placing in the hands of one institution an order blank to every home in the Province. "Toronto is not the whole of Ontario," he declared. "It would probably pay the store in question to lose \$20,000 or \$30,000 a year for the cheap advertising it gets." The Manitoba Government were well advised to refuse a similar contract under similar conditions.

The books, Mr. MacKay submitted, were not the equal of their predecessors. The primer, he was satisfied, would have to be withdrawn as a total failure.

Need for Technical Training.

"We are not moving fast enough, not swinging along with a Provincial sweep, towards meeting the industrial needs of our lads," declared the Liberal leader. Everyone was proud of the University, but hundreds of lads entered the trades. "What we want," he urged, "is the evening technical school to supplement the work of the day."

Dealing with the power question Hon. Mr. MacKay said that there was a tendency on the part of the unwary and unwise listener to think that the present Hydro-Electric Commission were the sole and only people to grapple with the problem of cheap power. The old municipal commission was formed in 1903, whereby a union of municipalities provided for the working out of the scheme. The present project was the natural evolution of the movement originated in 1903. If understood historically it would be seen that the present Hydro-Electric laws were passed upon that.

Advances had been made. One commission now acted for many. The right arm of the Province gave it strength. The Liberal leader combatted the statement of the Minister of Power that the scheme had never been changed. He gave an instance. The original by-laws gave the price for power ready for distribution. Under the present scheme the risk and cost of transmission was placed on the municipalities. The change in the scheme was made without a vote of

the ratepayers, which was one of the instances of arbitrary centralization of power to which he objected.

Support for Power Project.

The Liberal leader made an emphatic declaration of his own support and the support of the party which he led for the power movement. "We are in whole-souled accord with the project," he said, "but we are not in accord with the methods adopted in working it out."

Mr. MacKay referred in detail to certain of the cases of farmers who claimed to have received unfair treatment from the agents of the commission in the purchase of the easements on the right of way. He read the statements of farmers interested and of the Warden of the County of Wentworth, who acted as arbitrator, to combat the figures quoted by the Minister of Power in his address. They had not been treated decently, he claimed.

"Better than the building of that sawdust wharf," put in Mr. T. W. McGarry of South Renfrew.

Ontario's First Duty.

"My hon. friend refers to Dominion politics," replied Mr. MacKay. "It occurs to me that we would do better to attend to our own politics, and see that we do things right here. The Liberals at Ottawa will take care of themselves. It is our duty to see that things are properly carried on here, and to do our own Provincial business in a proper manner." (Applause.)

Continuing, the Opposition leader said that he had no doubt that had the Attorney-General or the Minister of Power been personally on the scene these things would never have happened. They must, however, accept the responsibility for their agents. They should have sent a competent valuator along.

Hon. Mr. Beck interrupted to explain and the final valuator of the lands was a Mr. Farley, a Liberal in politics, and a buyer of right-of-way

for the Grand Trunk. This gentleman, he said, held a high reputation in the railway world.

"That is the point," promptly commented Mr. MacKay. "The Minister says the final valuator. Why final? Why not just one? Why send McCormick, then Stewart, then Ellis, then Lawson, and finally, when all this trouble has been created, send along a good final valuator who is a Liberal?" (Opposition applause.)

Proceeding, the speaker reiterated his faith in the project, but maintained that its carrying out had been faulty, abounding in arbitrary legislation, and a lack of trusting the people. As Hon. Mr. MacKay concluded he was greeted with prolonged Opposition applause.

The Premier Replies.

Sir James Whitney, in opening, expressed the hope that the speech the House had just heard was not the valedictory of the Liberal leader. The Opposition, he claimed, was in a peculiar position. Its leader announced his endorsement of the power project, while his followers "vociferously pounded their desks to evince their hatred of it." As to the declaration that there was a shortage in the finances of the Province, the Premier said that no such suggestion had previously emanated from any of the speakers in the debate. "Even *The Globe*," said the Premier, "has never said there was a deficit in our finances."

The Government awarded the school books contract, Sir James maintained, purely upon business lines. They accepted the lowest tender. "Had it been otherwise," he observed, "the cover of the honorable leader's desk would only have lasted half an hour under his denunciations." The Government had set itself to secure cheap books, and have done so. The Liberal Government of another Province had appealed to them to get a similar contract. As to the character of the books, Sir James quoted Sir Joseph Thompson, head of the science department at Cambridge University, who had declared that the books showed "great skill and discretion in the selection of their contents, and evidenced the fact that Ontario was in the forefront in all things educational."

Mr. McDougall's Challenge.

The Premier then returned to power. He declared that the Elec-

trical Development Company and the Electric Light Company had sent their minions to Ottawa to establish a so-called Economic Society. They went to the constituency whence Mr. McDougall came.

Mr. McDougall interrupted. "If the honorable gentleman means to insinuate that I had anything to do with it, let him come out like a man and say so."

"I said that the society went to Ottawa, and that he was there," replied Sir James, "and both statements are true." Writers out-at-the-elbow, were, continued the Premier, paid for the work they there did. They sent out communications alleging that the school book contract was doing a great wrong to all retail dealers. "It was just another step," continued Sir James, "in the carefully planned scheme to ruin and destroy the power project and break down the Government. Honorable gentlemen opposite worked as ambassadors of these companies. Last session, under the instruction of the solicitor for the Electric Light Company, one of them introduced a resolution, the most amazing thing that anyone ever heard of in the heavens above, the earth beneath, or the waters under the earth. They are filled with venom and dislike to everything relating to the power project."

The Liberal leader entered a protest at this point, and the stormy scene before described then occurred.

Sir James Looks Back.

Resuming his address, the Premier ridiculed the Opposition claim that the present prosperity was built upon past Liberal legislation. He detailed what had been accomplished under the present administration, the new election law, the license law, the power project, the increase in payments to schools, cheap school books, aid to the University, the establishment of a Railway and Municipal Board, an adequate system of railway taxation, and the doubling of the revenue. He denied that in Opposition his party had voted against the tax on corporations. They had opposed only the idea that none of the tax should be paid to the municipalities. He also claimed that the present Government had approved and supported the proposition to build the T. & N. O. Railway. To offset Opposition claim of past legislative wisdom, the Premier retailed certain incidents in the former regime which he characterized as scandalous. He concluded by a reference to a published letter from Mr. Wallace Nesbitt, K.C., to Sir Frederick Borden, condemning the power legislation of the Province. He characterized it as improper that a lawyer should thus communicate with one of the Judges who had to pass upon the appeal for disallowance.

Labor Scores Both Sides.

Mr. Allan Studholme, the Hamilton Labor man, concluded his address by scoring both parties. The Government immigration policy was vigorously condemned. "It is unbusinesslike and wasteful," was his comment. The Opposition was rapped over the knuckles on the power question. "Stop bucking the Hydro," was the Labor man's comment. "Go in for public ownership all down the line. Don't know the Government; pass them. Don't lag behind; get in front."

The Labor man warned the Premier that all the Opposition to the power policy did not come from party opponents. "I know, for I've been up against it myself," he declared. "Your own friends are trying to stab you in the back over this, your best policy, both you and Beck. You stated you had your backs to the wall. God knows you both needed to have them there to protect yourselves from attacks from behind by your own political friends."

Mr. A. H. Musgrove (North Huron) devoted his address to combatting the statements of Messrs. McEwing and Proudfoot on educational and textbook matters. As a former teacher and school inspector, Mr. Musgrove undertook to give expert testimony in support of the text-books and educational policy.

Premier Denies Report.

Before the orders of the day were called, Sir James Whitney directed attention to a report which had appeared in the press to the effect that the Government were considering the question of incorporating the single tax propaganda in the revised assessment act to be adopted this session. The statement, the Premier said, was utterly without foundation in fact.