

Mr. Graham endorsed the position taken by the Minister of Education. The County Judge is a good man to decide questions of equity, justice or law, but upon a matter requiring practical experience, such as arranging the school districts, the County Judge was as a rule less equipped than any other class of men. The decision of a commissioner such as the bill provided for would satisfy the people of the Island much better than the County Judge could hope to.

Mr. Matheson denounced this as another link in the whole system of centralization of power in the Minister of Education, which was being steadily pursued. They could not do anything without running to Toronto. It was another instance of the one-man power which was destroying the efficiency of the education of this Province.

Dr. Bridgland asked that the provisions of the bill applying to Manitoulin Island with respect to uniting the school districts and conveying the children to school be applied to the district of Muskoka.

Hon. Mr. Hardy, replying to Mr. Wardell, pointed out that it would be better to have independent and practical men to determine the question of the boundaries of school sections rather than the County Judge. These men would personally inspect the localities and take into consideration every feature of the local conditions. He desired to keep away from the law as much as possible in the settlement of these questions.

Mr. Whitney contended that the County Judge was the only man who could put his foot down and settle the disputes between contending factions satisfactorily.

Mr. Hoyle wanted to divide the Island into three sections, with three boards, who would settle the whole question and save the cost of the commission.

Hon. Mr. Ross pointed out that it would be impossible to make any such arbitrary division.

#### The Bonus Resolutions.

The debate upon the bonus resolutions was resumed by Mr. Carscalen, who thought there was a tendency towards too much paternalism in legislating with respect to the powers of municipalities. The municipalities should be the best judges as to the circumstances in voting bonuses. He referred to the great desire that the resources of the Province should be developed, and to the necessity that existed for the development of the mineral resources in order that the people of the Province might derive the advantages of those riches. It was especially desirable that smelting works should be erected in this country for that purpose, and in order to secure their establishment bonuses might be necessary. He alluded at some length to the wealth of northern Ontario, and assured the Government and the House that the Opposition would remove from the arena of politics any proposition for the development of the resources of the New Ontario, and heartily support the Government in any well-considered proposal for this purpose. Smelting works, of which he hoped to see many established throughout the country, were exceptional industries, in which the in-

vestment of capital was hazardous, and should be encouraged. The bonus system was perhaps necessary in respect to this class of argument. He was opposed to the resolution and amendment, but was quite willing to endorse a resolution that the House is uncompromisingly opposed to any system which enables one municipality to bid against another or to foster or build up an industry in its own city at the expense of non-assenting taxpayers.

Mr. Conmee contended that when two-thirds of the ratepayers in a municipality approved a bonus the by-law should stand. The resolution aimed to take away from the municipalities that right to tax themselves which they ought, to his mind, to possess. The hon. members were fighting now against a condition of affairs which might have existed in the past, but which could not now exist under the law as it stands. The hon. members who were supporting the resolution appeared to be afraid of themselves, and wanted to tie up the House. He appealed to the mover of the amendment.

Mr. Morrison, West Hastings, disapproved of the resolution, because it deprived the property-owners of the opportunity of improving and benefiting their property by encouraging the establishment of industries.

Mr. Kribs thought the resolution should get the six-months' hoist. He quoted local experience in proof of the beneficial effects of the bonus system upon municipalities.

The Speaker ruled the amendment to the amendment moved by Dr. McKay out of order.

Mr. Pattullo at this stage rose to reply to some of the arguments advanced against his resolution. He desired to make it clear that he had no intention of injuring or retarding the progress of the industries of the Province, and, replying to the remarks by Mr. Carscalen in reference to the encouragement of the iron smelting works, he pointed out that his first words in the House some years ago had been strongly advocating the development of the iron industries. But since that date circumstances had changed, the Government having in the meantime given great and generous encouragement to the smelting industries. He hoped the time would come when the House would place upon record a clear-cut and decided opinion that no municipal assistance be given directly or indirectly towards any industry. He agreed that his hon. friend from South Oxford had offered a suggestion which he was prepared to accept, providing for cases where loss had occurred by flood as well as fire, and he would be prepared to make provision for all other extremely exceptional circumstances. The adoption of his resolution would not, he pointed out, deprive any citizen of his right to appeal to the House. If this policy of aiding industries is a good one it should be the general law of the Province, and the municipalities should not have to come to the Legislature hat in hand asking for permission to evade the law.

Hon. Mr. Hardy pointed out that it was doubtful whether any resolution passed by the House would be binding unless crystallized into legislation. An