

dispensable to industrial success. There must be a profitable market for the products of any particular industry; it must be situated where the natural conditions were favorable, raw material was accessible and means of transportation were available, and the promoter must exercise brains, a special knowledge and modern methods. Instead of relying upon these conditions many manufacturers, to their great loss and subsequent failure, had been placing their trust in municipal props. If these municipal props were swept away the industries would be much more stable and prosperous in the future than they were now. The fear had been expressed that if the whole system of municipal aid were swept away the industries of the Province would all centre in such industrial centres as Toronto. He did not believe that at all. It was true that Toronto had advantages, but scores of other places had equally as good transportation facilities and possessed very much better waterpower. If new industries come to Toronto all would rejoice, provided that city was given no special privileges in the matter of taking industries away from other parts of Ontario. The bonus system had done a good deal to alarm capital. There were millions of unused capital in the world, but capitalists were deterred from investing in industries because of the knowledge that they had to compete against the municipal governments of the country. There never was a better time for putting into force the policy he enunciated. The manufacturers were prosperous, and, to use a current phrase, "it was the growing time." Finally, he urged as a last reason against the bonus system that it had a lowering effect upon the dignity of the House. Municipalities evidently did not treat the Legislature seriously. There was a general law, but some of the municipalities did not seem to think it was necessary to enforce it. When special laws were required they considered the legislators,

in fact, not as law-makers, but as law-breakers.

Mr. Marter heartily approved of the resolution, but at the request of Mr. Whitney, who was absent, asked that the debate be adjourned. As member for the City of Toronto he reminded the House that he held in his hand a resolution by the municipal Council of that city approving of the principle of the resolution.

Dr. Pyne was quite willing to endeavor to prevent undue competition amongst the municipalities in securing industries, but the hon. member for North Oxford had not pointed out any other way by which industries could be initiated and encouraged in new countries than by municipal aid. He referred to Germany and other countries where the manufacturing industries had been stimulated and fostered by Government aid. If the municipalities do not assist and encourage industries the Government ought to undertake that duty.

#### An Opportune Resolution.

Hon. Geo. W. Ross rose, not to discuss the question, but rather to bear his testimony to the lucid arguments demonstrating the careful study which his hon. friend, the mover of the resolution, had given to a subject involv-

ing many economic difficulties. It appeared to him that the subject had come before the House none too soon. There might have been conditions in the early history of the country when it might have been necessary from want of capital or other reasons to aid industries in their infancy. They would all admit that some of this capital has been usefully applied, but it is within the knowledge of members of the House that a great deal of it has been absolutely wasted. Conditions are not now, however, the same as they were 25 or 30 years ago. There is abundant wealth in the country now, as the report of the banking institutions shows, and the very large deposits bearing interest which could be much more profitably invested in industrial and commercial enterprises. It is, therefore, clear that there is no want of capital in this country. No manufacturer need want for the necessary bank accommodation when his enterprise is built upon the proper foundation. The hon. member was, therefore, justified in bringing this question before the House and the country at this juncture. Enterprises had been started under the bonus system which perhaps were not justified by the necessity of the occasion and had never attained prosperity. The industries of Great Britain had, he pointed out, been built up by the enterprise and skill of British manufacturers and artisans without being bolstered up by bonuses, and had obtained control of the markets of the world. The note which his hon. friend struck appealed to the intelligence and enterprise of the people of the Province. Citizens of Ontario, with the intelligence and skill which they claimed to have and which he was satisfied they possessed, were able under ordinary economic conditions which prevail in Ontario to compete with the world. This had been proven by the experience of some of our great manufacturers who are sending their goods to the four corners of the earth. Agriculture is the great industry of the country, but the farmers had not been bonused. It was the strong arm and superior intelligence of the farmer that had enabled him to compete in the markets of the world. He was also glad to hear the remarks of his hon. friend upon the freedom which hon. members would enjoy in the future from the lobby for private bills of this class, and the time of the House, which is now to a large extent occupied in the consideration of such measures, will also be saved if the House takes a positive position upon the question.

#### Mr. Conmee Opposed.

Mr. Conmee disagreed with the previous speakers. While agreeing that in the past there had been too much bonusing, such was not the case now. The hon. member in his resolution went too far; the people who voted the bonus were best qualified to know what they wanted, and as they had to foot the bill the House should not place too great restrictions upon them. The evil of too great interference with the municipalities might be greater than that of bonusing. In the interest of the newer sections he must oppose the resolution. He hoped the House would see the justice of allowing those districts the same freedom and liberty which the older portions of the country had enjoyed in regard to this privilege and which had so materially aided in the